Application No. 10/577,138 Docket No.: 12810-00239-US1 Amendment dated October 1, 2008

Reply to Office Action of July 1, 2008

DISCUSSION OF THE AMENDMENTS

Claims 1, 2, 4-6 and 15-20 were previously presented.

Claim 3 is cancelled.

Claims 7-9 are currently amended.

Claims 10-14 are withdrawn.

Claim 21 is new.

Upon entry of the amendments claims 1, 2 and 4-21 will be pending with claims 1, 2, 4-9 and 15-21 under active consideration.

The amendments to claims 7-9 are supported by the claims as previously presented.

New claim 21 is supported by claim 3 as previously presented.

The amendments to the claims correct informalities and do not limit the claim scope.

No new matter has been added.

REMARKS

Docket No.: 12810-00239-US1

The Office rejected claims 1-9 and 15-20 under 35 U.S.C. § 103(a) over <u>Gangne</u> (US 2003/0144440).

<u>Gangne</u> describes phosphorus-containing bidentate ligands (Formulas I and II in paragraph [0012]). Focusing on the phosphorus center of the structures I and II in <u>Gangne</u>, the phosphorus center can have the following connectivity:

$$(\mathsf{RArO})_{\mathsf{a}} \underbrace{\qquad \qquad }_{\mathsf{P}} (\mathsf{ArR})$$

where a and b individually are either 0, or 2, provided a + b = 2. Preferred aspects are a = 2 or a = 1 and b = 1 (see paragraphs [0022] and [0023]). Applicants note that <u>Gangne</u> requires a and b to be the same on both sides of the bidenate ligand in structures I and II. For example, <u>Gangne</u> does not distinguish a on one side of the bidentate ligand and a on the other side of the bidentate ligand. In other words, <u>both</u> sides of the bidentate ligand in <u>Gangne must</u> have a = 2, b = 2 or a = 1 and b = 1. The requirement excludes the possibility that a = 2 on one side of the bidentate ligand and b = 2 on the other side of the bidentate ligand. Formulas 1- 6 in claim 1 all have a structures such that a = 2 on one side of the molecule and b = 2 on the other side of the molecule. Accordingly, <u>Gangne</u> does not teach or suggest formulas 1- 6 in claim 1, and indeed, <u>Gangne</u> actually <u>teaches away</u> from Formulas 1- 6. Such a teaching away is indicative of non-obviousness (See MPEP 2144.05 (III)).

Accordingly, claims 1-9 and 15-20 would not have been obvious over <u>Gangne</u>, and therefore, Applicants respectfully request that the Office withdraw the rejection of claims 1-9 and 15-20 under 35 U.S.C. § 103 (a) over Gangne.

With regard to the rejection of claims 1-9 and 15-20 under U.S.C. \S 112, second paragraph, Applicants submit that the language in claim 1 is definite. Specifically, if X_n is not present the phenyl ring has all hydrogen atoms which is generally accepted in organic nomenclature. If X_n is present n is 1 or 2 and X is F, Cl or CF₃. Applicants believe this language and explanation make claim 1 clear and definite. Applicants submit that amended claim 3 (now claim 21) and 7-9 are free of the criticisms outlined on page 5 of the Office Action. Accordingly Applicants respectfully request that the Office withdraw the rejection of these claims under 35 U.S.C. \S 112, second paragraph and 35 U.S.C. \S 101.

Finally, Applicants request that should the Office allow claims 4 and 5, that the Office rejoin withdrawn claims 10-14 since these claims are process claims directed to using the product claims 4 and 5 and claims 10-14 contain all the limitations of claims 4 and 5 (MPEP§ 821.04).

In light of the remarks above, Applicants submit the application is in condition for allowance. Favorable reconsideration is respectfully requested.

Applicant believes no fee is due with this response. However, if a fee is due, please charge our Deposit Account No. 22-0185, under Order No. 12810-00239-US1 from which the undersigned is authorized to draw.

Dated: October 1, 2008 Respectfully submitted,

Electronic signature: //Georg M. Hasselmann/ Georg M. Hasselmann Registration No.: 62,324 CONNOLLY BOVE LODGE & HUTZ LLP 1875 Eye Street, NW Suite 1100 Washington, DC 20006 (202) 331-7111 (202) 293-6229 (Fax)

Attorney for Applicant